

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
SAN JOSE DIVISION

ERIC BENEDICT, on behalf of himself and classes of those similarly situated,)	Case No.: 13-CV-0119-LHK
)	ORDER RE: PROTECTIVE ORDER
Plaintiff,)	
v.)	
HEWLETT-PACKARD COMPANY,)	
Defendant.)	

On May 8, 2013, pursuant to this Court's Order, the parties submitted a Joint Letter Brief addressing whether Opt-In Plaintiffs in the instant case should be given access to Defendant's discovery designated "CONFIDENTIAL." ECF No. 39.

The extent to which FLSA opt-in plaintiffs are subject to individualized discovery remains unsettled. *See Hoffman v. Constr. Protective Servs., Inc.*, 541 F.3d 1175, 1179 (9th Cir. 2008) (noting that the district court in that action had recognized this area of the law as unsettled); *Coldiron v. Pizza Hut, Inc.*, CV03-05865TJHMCX, 2004 WL 2601180 (C.D. Cal. Oct. 25, 2004) (recognizing two lines of cases regarding individualized discovery in opt-in class actions). In the parties' Joint Letter Brief, neither party cites to precedent governing opt-in plaintiffs' access to materials designated as confidential, or the implications of such access for individualized discovery. Furthermore, each of the cases Defendant cites as authority for opt-in discovery refers to discovery following conditional certification of an opt-in class. *See Hill v. R&L Carriers Shared*

1 *Services, LLC*, CV 09-1907 CW MEJ, 2010 WL 3769247, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 22, 2010);
 2 *Coldiron*, 2004 WL 2601180, at *2; *Abubakar v. City of Solano*, CIVS-06-2268LKKEFB, 2008
 3 WL 508911, at *2 (E.D. Cal. Feb. 22, 2008). In the instant case, Plaintiff's Motion for Conditional
 4 FLSA Certification will be heard on September 19, 2013.

5 The Court finds that at this stage of the litigation, prior to conditional certification, Opt-In
 6 Plaintiffs may access Defendant's discovery designated "CONFIDENTIAL," under the conditions
 7 Plaintiff proposes in the Joint Letter Brief. However, any Opt-In Plaintiff who chooses to access
 8 such material shall also be subject to reciprocal, reasonable, and appropriate discovery.

9 **IT IS SO ORDERD.**

10 May 14, 2013

11 
 12 _____
 13 LUCY H. KOH
 14 United States District Judge
 15
 16
 17
 18
 19
 20
 21
 22
 23
 24
 25
 26
 27
 28

United States District Court
For the Northern District of California